



# **Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru** **The National Assembly for Wales**

## **Y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes** **The Enterprise and Business Committee**

**Dydd Iau, 20 Mehefin 2013**  
**Thursday, 20 June 2013**

### **Cynnwys** **Contents**

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

Ymchwiliad i Entrepreneuriaeth ymysg Pobl Ifanc—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth  
Inquiry into Youth Entrepreneurship—Evidence Session

Ymchwiliad i Entrepreneuriaeth ymysg Pobl Ifanc—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth  
Inquiry into Youth Entrepreneurship—Evidence Session

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod  
Motion under Standing Order No. 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal,  
cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.  
In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol**  
**Committee members in attendance**

Mick Antoniw	Llafur Labour
Byron Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Keith Davies	Llafur Labour
Yr Arglwydd/Lord Dafydd Elis-Thomas	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Alun Ffred Jones	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Nick Ramsay	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Welsh Conservatives (Committee Chair)
David Rees	Llafur Labour
Joyce Watson	Llafur Labour

**Eraill yn bresennol**  
**Others in attendance**

Jo Banks	Pennaeth Cymorth ac Arweiniad i Bobl Ifanc, Llywodraeth Cymru Head of Youth Support and Guidance, Welsh Government
Philip Drakeford	Pennaeth Polisi a Strategaeth (Addysg), Gyrfa Cymru Head of Policy and Strategy (Education), Careers Wales
Sue Poole	Rheolwr Menter mewn Addysg, Coleg Gŵyr, Canolfan Entrepreneuriaeth Ranbarthol De-orllewin Cymru Education Enterprise Manager, Gower College, South-west Wales Regional Entrepreneurship Hub
Emlyn Williams	Rheolwr Menter, Coleg Menai, Canolfan Entrepreneuriaeth Ranbarthol Gogledd-orllewin Cymru Enterprise Manager, Coleg Menai, North-west Wales Regional Entrepreneurship Hub

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol**  
**National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Michael Dauncey	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Ffion Emyr Bourton	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Siân Phipps	Clerc Clerk

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 1.15 p.m.*  
*The meeting began at 1.15 p.m.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon**  
**Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions**

[1] **Nick Ramsay:** Good afternoon. I welcome Members and our witnesses to this afternoon's meeting of the Enterprise and Business Committee. The meeting is bilingual; headphones can be used to access simultaneous translation from Welsh to English on channel 1 on the headsets, or for amplification on channel 0. The meeting is being broadcast and a transcript will be published. I ask Members to please turn off their mobile phones. There is no need to touch the microphones; they will operate automatically. In the event of a fire alarm, please follow the ushers. We have two apologies today, from Julie James and Eluned Parrott.

### **Ymchwiliad i Entrepreneuriaeth ymysg Pobl Ifanc—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth Inquiry into Youth Entrepreneurship—Evidence Session**

[2] **Nick Ramsay:** We are continuing with our inquiry into youth entrepreneurship. We have a further evidence session ahead of us this afternoon. I welcome our witnesses. Thank you for agreeing to come here today to answer our questions. I also thank you for your written evidence. Would you like to give your names and positions for the Record of Proceedings?

[3] **Mr Banks:** I am Jo Banks, the head of youth support and guidance within the Welsh Government.

[4] **Mr Drakeford:** Good afternoon, everybody. I am Philip Drakeford, the head of education policy for Careers Wales.

[5] **Nick Ramsay:** Great. As I said, thank you for agreeing to be with us today. We have a large number of questions, so I propose that we go straight into those. If I move things on at any point, it is because we need to make progress, not that I am not interested in what you have to say. The first question is from Dafydd Elis-Thomas.

<p>[6] <b>Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas:</b> Diolch yn fawr, Mr Cadeirydd. Mae gennym ddi-ddordeb yn y newidiadau sydd wedi digwydd i Yrfa Cymru. Yn naturiol, rydym wedi dilyn penderfyniadau'r Llywodraeth o ran newid statws a safle'r corff. Felly, hoffwn wybod yn arbennig—</p>	<p><b>Lord Elis-Thomas:</b> Thank you very much, Mr Chair. We are interested in the changes that have taken place in Careers Wales. Naturally, we have followed the Government's decisions with regard to changing the status and position of the organisation. What we particularly want to know—</p>
---	--

[7] **Nick Ramsay:** Dafydd, would you just hang on for a moment, please? We are just getting the translation kit sorted. I am sorry about that.

[8] **Lord Elis-Thomas:** How will I remember what I said? [*Laughter.*]

[9] **Nick Ramsay:** I am sure you will.

[10] **Lord Elis-Thomas:** I will make an effort.

[11] **Nick Ramsay:** Sorry. We are changing headsets. I had that one last week. [*Laughter.*]

<p>[12] <b>Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas:</b> Ein diddordeb mewn perthynas â'r ymchwiliad hwn yw effaith y newidiadau yn swyddogaeth a threfniadaeth Gyrfya Cymru a'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer addysgu pobl ifanc ynghylch entrepreneuriaeth a chynnal ymwybyddiaeth mewn entrepreneuriaeth ymysg pobl ifanc. A fydddech yn dweud y</p>	<p><b>Lord Elis-Thomas:</b> Our interest in relation to this inquiry is the impact of the changes to the functions and arrangements of Careers Wales and the provision for educating young people about entrepreneurship and supporting entrepreneurship among young people. Would you say that the new arrangements will allow for more provision, or less? We</p>
--	---

bydd y trefniadau newydd yn galluogi mwy o ddarpariaeth, neu lai? Rydym wedi cael tystiolaeth y bore yma y bydd yn effeithio yn andwyol ar y ddarpariaeth sydd wedi bod yn y gorffennol gan rai darparwyr.

have had evidence this morning that it will have a detrimental impact on the provision that has been available in the past from some providers.

[13] **Mr Drakeford:** The question for me is whether the impact of the provision will be improved, as opposed to weighing the provision by numbers, so to speak. Our paper makes no secret of the fact that, until 2012, Careers Wales was quite heavily into the delivery of enterprise and entrepreneurship projects in schools and colleges. On the first page of our paper, we give an idea of the sort of volumes that were being achieved at that time. On the second page of our paper, we give an idea of what else we were doing, but, again, with an accent on delivering activity in classrooms in order to encourage a lively understanding of what enterprise and entrepreneurship might entail.

[14] All throughout that period, at the end of that period, and now, we have been conscious of research, which we have sometimes been a part of. The example in the paper is the five countries symposium on enterprise education, but there are many other pieces of research that point in the same direction in relation to ‘bolt-on activities’, as we tend to call them—that is, activities that are not integral to the curriculum and delivered in classrooms each and every day in all subjects. If our efforts are bolt-on in nature, then, while we might feel that we have done a lot, we may be disappointed in what we have achieved. Research tells us that the achievement of attitudes that are more consistent with a positive mindset towards entrepreneurship is more likely if we have an approach that is integrated into the curriculum.

[15] As far as Careers Wales’s remit and role going forward is concerned, as our paper suggests, we believe that we have an opportunity—arguably, a better opportunity, in some ways—to make an impact if we deliver a good information, advice and guidance service, and ~~on~~ effective engagement of employers and employees, that is, those in the workplace and entrepreneurs, and bring them into schools, classrooms and into contact with teachers. At the same time, we need to deliver on our efforts towards building the capacity of schools and the ability and confidence of teachers to take entrepreneurship and deal with it in a positive way through their teaching. If we are effective in those focused aspects of our new remit, then, as I said, arguably, we could make a bigger difference in the long term.

[16] My final comment would be that, at this point, when we are moving away from the approach of the past 10 or 11 years, when we were in more of a delivery mode, to our new remit, whereby we are looking to be perhaps being a little more thoughtful in how we contribute to a longer-term development, there will be—in the period that we are in now—some unsettledness and adjustments that we will need to make, as will those whom we have worked with in schools and colleges, whom we will continue to work with, albeit in a different way. So, I am not surprised to hear from some witnesses that they feel that, in a sense, we are now doing less. I am not surprised at that.

[17] **Nick Ramsay:** Dafydd, did you want to come back on that?

[18] **Lord Elis-Thomas:** Yes. I would come back just on one point, following on from your first answer. So, would your advice to Young Enterprise Wales and other past recipients of direct funding through young business partnerships be that they should not pursue the avenue of being directly funded by Government, or indirectly funded through an agency of Government, but should look for other ways?

[19] **Mr Drakeford:** That has been our advice. That has needed to be our advice, because we have known that we would not have the means to support them in that way any longer.

From 2001 to 2012—certainly in the latter half of that period—we looked all the while to identify other means of supporting those programmes, because we could see that this could not be a long-term funding channel that we or the Welsh Government would be able to provide.

[20] **Nick Ramsay:** Jo, did you want to add to that?

[21] **Mr Banks:** Yes, thank you. It is important to stress that the core business of Career Choices Dewis Gyrfa/Careers Wales is the delivery of an impartial all-age bilingual careers information, advice and guidance service. The delivery of enterprise has always been a curriculum responsibility, which the careers service has, historically, very much supported. There is a change in terms of how direct that support will be. The new remit for the organisation re-defines that relationship, but it does not leave the sector high and dry, inasmuch as Careers Wales is now remitted very clearly to work with schools to build capacity and to engage with employers to help broker an interface.

[22] Historically, there was a lot of variable practice across the companies across Wales, and part of developing the remit, as well as taking some difficult policy decisions on these areas, was about ensuring consistency. That has meant a greater change for some than for others.

[23] **David Rees:** I totally understand the position of Careers Wales: you are supporting the development of the careers aspect, not necessarily the curriculum aspect. However, we must remember that the outcome of some of these would actually be a career as well. I will just go back to one point. You quoted the five countries report—we seem to be seeing a change now, six years after this report was produced, so why have we not seen this change prior to this, or is it changing now purely because you do not have the finances?

[24] **Mr Drakeford:** It has probably been nudged in the direction partly by the financial settlement and the reduction in resource; I am sure that has played its part. Changing these approaches does seem to take a long time. I sometimes get frustrated as to how long it actually takes to move from one way of doing things to a different way of doing things, particularly when we have had, as you say, a conference in 2007 that has pointed out that there is probably a better way of doing this. I have to say that that report is just one of many; there have been reports prior to it and there have certainly been reports since it that have said precisely the same. I spend my working day in west Wales, and, locally, Swansea has a group of organisations called the BEES group—building enterprise education in Swansea—that all gather together around this effort to encourage enterprise and entrepreneurship in education. They all share that same conclusion, namely that the way in which we need to work is more around having enterprise and entrepreneurship as an integral part of the curriculum rather than as a bolted-on element.

[25] Why has it taken us this long? I do not know. We work with schools that have annual cycles, it seems, or a yearly plan, which, sometimes, is to do what they did last year. If the activity is a bolted-on activity, then the tendency is that it gets taken out again for another year. So, maybe our opportunity to intervene and to change the pattern only comes very occasionally. That may explain why it takes as long as it does. However, my tendency at the moment is to say that we have an opportunity now to look again at how we engage business, why we engage business, and what part we want schools to play in having sustainable relationships with business. They need to be proper relationships—a partnership of equals rather than one of convenience. We have an opportunity to look at that now and we have an opportunity to look at the role of teachers and to provide support so that they can take enterprise as a concept and as an issue into their teaching, rather than for them to think that it is somebody else's role to deal with at the end of term. We have that opportunity now and we have to grasp it.

[26] **Mick Antoniwi:** I am little confused by the answers now. It does not really inspire me with a great deal of confidence that we know exactly where we are or what we are delivering. How much practical expertise within the career service, in terms of entrepreneurialism and business, do you actually have? Do you feel confident enough that you have the tools to be able to deliver what is seems you are being asked to do?

[27] **Mr Drakeford:** We most certainly have the tools to deliver reliable information, advice and guidance. We most certainly have the tools to go about the task of engaging employers effectively, and we most certainly have the tools to be able to assist teachers and schools to grow their approach as to how they plan their curriculum and deliver their teaching.

[28] **Keith Davies:** Mi ofynnaf fy nghwestiwn yn Gymraeg hefyd. Clywsom y bore yma gan Menter yr Ifanc Cymru nad yw bellach yn gallu rhoi'r help yr oedd yn gallu ei roi o'r blaen i ysgolion. O ran y gwaith newydd a'r newid mewn ffocws, sut mae hynny yn mynd i hyrwyddo entrepreneuriaeth mewn ysgolion pan nad yw Menter yr Ifanc Cymru ar gael?

**Keith Davies:** I will ask my question in Welsh as well. We have heard this morning from Young Enterprise Wales that it cannot now give schools the help that it could before. In terms of the new work and the change in focus, how will that promote entrepreneurship in schools when Young Enterprise Wales is not available?

1.30 p.m.

[29] **Mr Drakeford:** I suppose it is important to point out first of all that Young Enterprise Wales is one agency or project that offers to deliver enterprise education support to schools. In a sense, the approach I am describing, which is one that we have taken from the remit given to us by the Welsh Government, recognises the resources and projects of the kind that young enterprise provide. However, if our strategy was based entirely on being able to afford to buy those resources in, then it would be a rather shaky strategy. Instead, we need to look at the affordability, the sustainability and, most importantly for me, the effectiveness of enterprise education. We need to look to build it into the curriculum more, rather than to have it added onto the curriculum. The strategy is deliberate and it may be because resources are now less available than they once were. It may be that we have now been forced to confront that fact. However, rather than going forward with a pale imitation for 2013 onwards of what we had from 2001 onwards, we are recognising what research tells us is actually the sustainable and impactful way of doing things. It will feel different, and it does feel different. It feels different for Careers Wales and it will feel different for schools. For some, it will feel like it is less than it was, until we are able to build up that momentum and capacity in schools, and build that employer engagement. It seems to me that that is a sound strategy to follow.

[30] **Keith Davies:** Rwy'n derbyn hynny, oherwydd cawsom yr un ateb gan Golegau Cymru ac Addysg Uwch Cymru cyn cinio. Roedden nhw'n dweud y dylai mwy o hyn fod yn y cwricwlwm. Gallaf weld hynny. Mae'r ymchwiliad hwn yn edrych ar bobl ifanc sy'n mynd i fod yn *entrepreneurs*. Roeddwn yn gofyn yn gynharach y bore yma i'r rhai oedd o'n blaenau a ddylwn gael siop un stop. A fydddech, fel Gyrfa Cymru, yn meddwl y dylech fod yn rhan o hynny, gan weithio â'r holl asiantaethau eraill? Rydym eisiau gweld—a gwelais y geiriau yn eich

**Keith Davies:** I accept that, because that was the answer we had from CollegesWales and Higher Education Wales before lunch. They said that there should be more of this in the curriculum. I can see that. This inquiry is looking at young people who are going to be entrepreneurs. I asked those who appeared before us earlier this morning whether we should have a one-stop shop. Would you, as Careers Wales, think that you should be part of that, working with all the other agencies? We want to see—and I saw the words in your report—not outputs but outcomes. One of

adroddiad—*outcomes* nid *outputs*. Un o'r those would be young people starting their  
rheini fyddai gweld pobl ifanc yn dechrau own businesses. How will Careers Wales  
busnesau eu hunain. Sut fydd Gyrfa Cymru support those young people?  
yn cefnogi'r bobl ifanc hynny?

[31] **Mr Drakeford:** The concept of working as part of a multi-agency approach is essential. As often as I hear young people—or people of any age, frankly—saying that they have been unable to find the support that they require, I also hear people saying that they are bamboozled by the support that is available. You can take your choice, really. I tend to go with the latter. I tend to see a plethora of initiatives that, unless you are involved day-to-day in understanding their particularisms, make you very quickly wonder whether they are all just sort of doing the same thing. So, which one do you pick? I would not hide from that fact that maybe this is partly driven by circumstances—which is a good thing, is it not?—and partly driven by budgets and other requirements. However, it is now vital that we have what we in Careers Wales call the ‘family approach’—that multi-agency approach.

[32] So, my first answer is, ‘Yes, we very much wish to be part of that family’. So, what part do we play? Do we provide business advice? Do we provide financial support to fledgling businesses? No we do not. We provide careers information, advice and guidance. We take people of all ages—although we are talking in particular about young people this afternoon—through the stages of being able to access the information that will allow them, and maybe their teachers, their parents and their brothers and sisters, to turn the idea around in their own minds, and consider the idea by saying, ‘I think that I would like to start a business. What information do you have? What information do I need? What information is out there?’ I know that I would say this, but [careerswales.com](http://careerswales.com) provides a very good first point of access to information about a whole range of careers. It is impartial, there is no spin on it, and no-one is trying to coax or tempt you in. It gives you the facts. You can watch videos of real, live entrepreneurs. You can then spin off to some of the more detailed websites of other organisations in the family, who will, if you think that your interest is worth pursuing, be able to provide you with the details that you require.

[33] However, our job does not end there. From information we go to advice. I might think, ‘I wouldn’t mind starting up my own business. It sounds like a good idea.’ In fact, I read earlier this week a report for last year by People 1st, one of the sector skills councils, which reported that the greatest number of start-up businesses across all sectors was in the hospitality sector. However, the death rate of those businesses—a death within three years—was also the highest of all sectors. It partly attributed that to the fact that people come in to start a business in that sector because they have made that decision based on a notion of lifestyle. People might think, ‘Cor, what a great business to be in. I can wear shorts every day’. So, their decision is really based on something of a whim. They might start up a business without having thought things through, either with good information or with good advice. What do I mean by good advice? If I thought that I would like to start up a business, I would have to ask myself whether I have the skills, so I would need to know what the necessary skills were. So, before I invested any of my time or money into that business, I would need to know whether I have the skills. Our careers advisers are skilled in helping people to understand what skills they have and in matching their skills with their career ideas so that people can come to a more balanced decision and are able to say, ‘I have what is needed and I have the initiative or the drive to gain the skills that I do not have’. Our service also takes our customers and clients through that process. We do that with impartiality, because the decision, at the end of the day, lies with the client. The decision is for the young person or the person of whatever age we are dealing with.

[34] We would finally help them with some guidance, perhaps to help them to understand how they might need to improve, to be certain of their career expectations, and to manage those a little better, and to help them seek support for further learning in order to be able to

stand a better chance of success. However, certainly when it comes to things like financing your business, we know when it is the right time, and we know to whom to pass that client on when we have done our bit.

[35] The other bit of our business—as I have explained already—is about working with teachers and employers. Even at the starting point—and I understand, Keith, that you are asking about when they are ready to start in business—there is a role for the employers, teachers or trusted mentors whom young people come to trust over time. We want to see the relationship between schools and employers going as far as it can beyond the classroom, beyond the time that those young people are in the schools, so that, if they need that helping hand, someone they can network with or someone who can help them to get into the networks that they need, there is a door that is ajar, at least, that helps them into the business community. We want our role in bringing employers to the party, so to speak, to have that sort of aspiration, not just having them come in on a wet Wednesday afternoon in July and do something that is fun and exciting but stops at 3.45 p.m. and that is it.

[36] **Nick Ramsay:** Are you done, Keith?

[37] **Keith Davies:** Yes. Thank you.

[38] **Nick Ramsay:** Mick is next, but please be brief, because we need to move on.

[39] **Mick Antoniwi:** How would you evaluate the effectiveness of the advice that you give and the outcomes of the advice and participation? Do you have any statistics or a general overview as to how it is working?

[40] **Mr Drakeford:** Yes, we do destination surveys, so we know whether the intended destination of any of our clients becomes their destination and whether they sustain that destination. One of our new roles, or extended roles, is to take that tracking and recording and to reflect on whether the intended career path was followed, whether somebody fell off it at a certain point and why, whether, where and how they got back on it, or whether they did not. We have an expanding role in doing that tracking, so that we know whether what we did, based on the evidence, worked, and whether it delivered sustainable outcomes or ones that lasted for three months and then died away. That is so that we can inform how we deliver our service better where needed, going forward.

[41] **Mick Antoniwi:** Could you give us a summary as to how you think you are doing on it? How successful is your work?

[42] **Mr Drakeford:** Do you mean in terms of entrepreneurship?

[43] **Mick Antoniwi:** Yes.

[44] **Mr Drakeford:** Going back to what I said a moment ago, we do not take the client through to the point of setting up, financing and structuring their business. We take them to the point of making a rational, informed choice about whether this is the right path for them. We do not collect information about how many then take that path. But, again, research will tell us and we were talking earlier about the percentage of young people who either follow that path, or who say now that they are considering following that path.

[45] **Nick Ramsay:** Could I ask about your involvement in the youth entrepreneurship strategy—YES? There has been a shift towards more ‘widespread active employer engagement’—I am quoting—which might include more emphasis on direct links between business people and young people. Do you think that there should be more emphasis on those links?



[46] **Mr Drakeford:** Yes, we do. As I have explained, we have a significant role to play in that. We need to make sure that the part that we play joins up with the part that any other organisation might play in securing that increased employer engagement. If I have learnt nothing else, I have learnt that multiple approaches to the same employers by a dozen or more organisations, all asking—it appears—for the same thing is probably what will kill off the interest quickest of all. So, we must have a co-ordinated approach to this. I have mentioned in the paper that we are working with sector skills councils and Business in the Community, in particular, to seek to improve that co-ordinated effort, so that we are not all chasing employers to the point where they disconnect from all of us.

[47] **Nick Ramsay:** Before I bring Ffred in, Young Enterprise Wales has suggested that the changes in the remit of Careers Wales could put the YES strategy at risk. How would you respond to that? Obviously, from your expression, you dismiss that.

[48] **Mr Drakeford:** I am puzzled by that comment. If you read, up to 2010, what Careers Wales was doing that contributed to the strategy, what you would read is what we have presented to you on page 1 of our paper—a lot of numbers about things that we have done. So, yes, perhaps I would accept that there is likely to be that temporary lull, or dip, while we are all changing the direction that we take, but with regard to a long-term dent in the strategy, no, I would not share that concern.

[49] **Nick Ramsay:** That is great. Alun Ffred Jones is next.

[50] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ymddiheuraf fy mod yn hwyr, Gadeirydd. Byddaf yn gofyn fy nghwestiwn yn Gymraeg. Rydych newydd ddweud bod angen cynllun strategol neu ddull o weithredu cydlynol er mwyn sicrhau nad yw cyflogwyr yn cael eu boddi gan nifer o'r un fath o geisiadau. Pwy sy'n gyfrifol am sicrhau bod cynllun cydlynol ar gyfer y gwaith hwn?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Apologies for my late arrival, Chair. I will ask my question in Welsh. You just said that there needs to be a strategic plan in place or a co-ordinated approach to ensure that employers are not swamped in a number of the same type of applications. Whose responsibility is it to ensure that there is a co-ordinated plan in place to take forward this work?

1.45 p.m.

[51] **Mr Drakeford:** I am not sure that this is one organisation or one person's responsibility. That, probably, is part of the reason why the situation is as it is. Each feels that he or she has an organisational responsibility, and competition ensues to get to the employer and to get them to support 'our' project or 'our' organisation before anybody else. That is part of the problem. As part of our response to the Welsh Government remit that urges us to work with and through other organisations in the business of engaging employer support, we have acknowledged that and we have replied by saying what I have said already, namely that we understand the rationale for doing that. We have proposed that, from autumn this year, Careers Wales should take the initiative and the lead—but not become responsible for, perhaps—in bringing together what we have termed a Wales education business partnership strategic alliance. It is a bit of a mouthful, but a carefully chosen term. It is strategic, meaning that we need to plan this better together, rather than needing everybody in the same room to rationalise down what each of us does, because if people think that that is what is going to happen—that they will lose some of their slice of the cake—they will not join. So, this is a strategic matter, to plan better our engagement with employers. 'Alliance', for me, is a word that suggests something that brings those organisations together. They will remain intact as organisations and they will not be brought into a single body, as such, but they are, nonetheless, aligned and allied to—

[52] **Nick Ramsay:** Ffred, do you want to come back briefly, because we only have about 15 minutes left?

[53] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan fod llawer o'r cyrff hyn yn cael eu hariannu yn uniongyrchol neu'n anuniongyrchol gan y Llywodraeth, onid y Llywodraeth a ddylai fod yn gwneud y cydlynu hwnnw? **Alun Ffred Jones:** As many of these bodies are funded directly or indirectly by the Government, should not the Government be doing that co-ordination work?

[54] **Mr Banks:** It is worth noting, in response, that the concept of the careers family is relevant here. As Philip has already mentioned, lots of players are involved in supporting careers and related advice and guidance through, for example, the higher education context, and schools and Careers Wales are part of that family. That concept, or the term, was generated out of the 2010 'Future Ambitions' report. In response to that, recognising the remit and the various changes that are happening at the moment, the Minister is establishing a new strategic forum for careers development, and that will start to meet later in the year, bringing together that family in order to give some high-level accountability, direction and opportunity for the stakeholders to work together on some of the themes that are clearly cross-cutting, but are not a responsibility simply for schools, Careers Wales or higher education careers services, for example. Employer organisations are also being invited to be part of that discussion, importantly. So, at that level, attempts are being made.

[55] **Nick Ramsay:** That is fine; we will move on. The next set of questions is from Byron Davies.

[56] **Byron Davies:** Hello. My question relates to Welsh Government policy. Is there sufficient clarity about the support that is currently available in terms of funding for young entrepreneurs in Wales? I ask that because we have heard various accounts this morning of the reduction in funding and of some witnesses not being aware of funding. Perhaps you could give your view on that, please.

[57] **Mr Banks:** Support for enterprise and entrepreneurship is very much embedded within the careers and the world of work framework, within 14-19 and within the Welsh baccalaureate. Mainstream funding supports and underpins those activities. Our funding and support for Careers Wales has reduced in recent years; it has come down from £36 million to £30 million this year. That has necessitated the development of a revised and more targeted remit, returning to core business, in some regards, to ensure that the quality of the all-age independent service is maintained and delivered. So, through the strategy and other mechanisms, attempts are made to ensure that funding is connected. However, there is also responsibility for stakeholders right across the family to work to ensure that happens at a school level, to be co-ordinated—

[58] **Nick Ramsay:** I apologise to our witnesses for the noise behind you. You did very well to ignore it. It is due to a problem with the lights. People are aware of it, so thanks for bearing with us. Byron, do you want to come in on that point?

[59] **Byron Davies:** Were you going to add anything, Mr Banks?

[60] **Mr Banks:** I had probably finished.

[61] **Byron Davies:** Mr Drakeford, do you want to add to that?

[62] **Mr Drakeford:** The only thing I would add, I suppose, is that there is a similar theme for me in that question as in the other questions that we have had, which is about the concerted or joined-up nature of our support, whether it is for curriculum advice for teachers

or start-up grants for young entrepreneurs. Is it a joined-up approach or it is piecemeal, and is it sufficient? For me, I would want to start with questions such as: how is it organised; where does it come from; does it make sense to the user, or does it baffle them?

[63] **Byron Davies:** How accessible is this to the individual, that is, to young people?

[64] **Mr Drakeford:** From a Careers Wales point of view—and I am at risk, I am sorry, of repeating myself—the service that we offer, which is not funding or access to grants for young entrepreneurs, is the information, advice, guidance and so on that I mentioned earlier. I believe that that is clear. It is now in one organisation in Wales, not six. It is offering its service in more modern ways through the website and the telephone, as well as the more conventional service in the office, face to face. We are making a good job towards presenting the service in a coherent fashion.

[65] I do not think that I can comment on the access to grants and start-up funding support. That is outside my remit.

[66] **Byron Davies:** How is that benchmarked, then? You say that you think that it is working and that you are making a better job of it, but how do you benchmark that?

[67] **Mr Drakeford:** With our website, for example, it is done by statistical means. We track the number of visitors to our website, where they visit on our website, how long they stay on our website, whether we see return visits, which might suggest that they are not getting what they wanted as quickly or as clearly as they would have wanted on the first visit. We run focus groups with all users, particularly young users in schools, to ask them how they respond to our service—not just our website, but all aspects of our service. So, we do it through surveying our customers, gauging their response and determining whether that response is consistent with what we were intending the service to deliver in output and in outcome terms.

[68] **Nick Ramsay:** We have only seven minutes left, Keith, so I will bring you in in a bit if we have time. David Rees is next.

[69] **David Rees:** I will try to be quick. We have obviously talked a lot about the educational aspects and, in your paper, you talk a lot about education. You also mention that you are stepping back from the work that you have been doing to deliver some of this. Could you quickly tell us when you intend to step back?

[70] **Mr Drakeford:** We have stepped back.

[71] **David Rees:** You have stepped back.

[72] **Mr Drakeford:** Yes, we have.

[73] **David Rees:** In that case, you mentioned stepping back and looking at the curriculum. Is the curriculum in place to deliver the enthusiasm in relation to enterprise, if nothing else, within the school environment and the education environment?

[74] **Mr Drakeford:** With an eye on the clock, there are three quick things to say there. First, the Welsh baccalaureate developments are in hand now as a result of the review of qualifications. That is a good opportunity for us to further cement in entrepreneurship and enterprise as part of the core and to make sure that that is then delivered effectively by all concerned—teachers, employers and others. So, that helps us to raise our game.

[75] The second thing, as far as the curriculum is concerned, is that the understandable

concentration on literacy and numeracy need not be at the cost of the topic that we are discussing. There is a very useful marriage of improvement in numeracy, for example, with the notion of entrepreneurship: understanding money and how numbers work in a business. I am very pleased to see the numeracy employer engagement scheme, but applications have recently closed, I think, for the third sector to get involved in engaging employers to do some numeracy-related project work in schools. I hope very much that that is done in concert with others such as Careers Wales who are involved in engaging employers and mobilising their support, and that it does not, as I said earlier, confuse employers.

[76] **David Rees:** I accept all that, but, on the developments that we are looking forward to, if you pull back, there will be a gap between the time that you pull back and when those will be enacted in the curriculum. So, how are we going to look at how the curriculum is developed during that gap?

[77] **Mr Drakeford:** We work with the curriculum that is there now. We do not sit and wait for the emerging curriculum to take place. There are also opportunities in the existing Welsh baccalaureate, for example, to develop this notion of entrepreneurship. Our stepping back is, as I have said, in order to enable us to refocus our efforts on building the capability and confidence of teachers to play their part, and that is what we are doing now.

[78] **Nick Ramsay:** Alun Ffred Jones is next, then Joyce Watson.

[79] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym wedi derbyn tystiolaeth bod diffyg cysondeb trwy Gymru ynghylch sut y mae entrepreneuriaeth yn cael ei hyrwyddo. Un enghraifft fach o hynny yw bod gwahanol systemau ar gyfer grantiau, hyd yn oed o fewn y gogledd ddwyrain. Cewch £2,000 yn sir Fflint, £1,000 yng Nghonwy, a rhywbeth arall yn Rhyl. Rydym wedi clywed hefyd gan golegau sy'n awgrymu bod y *hubs* newydd yn datblygu systemau eu hunain ar gyfer eu hardaloedd hwy. A ydych yn credu bod y diffyg cysondeb hwn yn problem?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We have had evidence that there is a lack of consistency throughout Wales in the way that entrepreneurship is promoted. One small example is that there are different systems of grants, even within the north east. You can get £2,000 in Flintshire, £1,000 in Conwy, and something else in Rhyl. We have heard from colleges that have suggested that the hubs are developing their own systems in their own areas. Do you believe that this lack of consistency is a problem?

[80] **Mr Banks:** Inevitably, at some level there will be a variation in the opportunities that are available in different parts of Wales, because of the challenges, and political and administrative areas, et cetera. That will always exist to some extent. The important thing for Careers Wales is that it has an accurate picture of the support that is available out there, and that, when it is providing information, advice and guidance services, it is appropriately positioned to direct people to those opportunities as they exist. It is not a problem that Careers Wales itself can solve. Ensuring that that is in place, and that that robust and up-to-date picture is provided and available through advisers, is important.

[81] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'ch dulliau o weithio yn gwbl cyson ar draws Cymru, a ydynt?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Your methods of working are consistent across Wales, are they?

[82] **Mr Banks:** Yes, they are.

[83] **Joyce Watson:** Looking to the future, because that is what enterprise and innovation has to be about, you touched on the sector skills councils and the way that you are going to work with them, and you said that you are producing standards and protocols, so have you any idea when they will be finalised, and whether we will be able to see them? Moving on to

research, development and innovation, how will you work with the legislation coming out of here? I will give an example—the fire sprinklers legislation is something that is coming to Wales uniquely, and there will be a need for people to fit those, and business opportunities either in making them, fitting them or training people to fit them. How you will take advantage of that? How fleet-footed will you be in taking advantage of these things that you can see coming this way? How will you be able to deliver that in education programmes, and, therefore, add to the prosperity of Wales?

2.00 p.m.

[84] **Mr Banks:** I will just lead on that by saying that it is the responsibility of my team as the sponsor branch for Careers Wales to advise it of key developments that are coming through. We maintain a regular dialogue with the chief executive and the senior team in terms of providing feedback and information on activities that are coming through. Critically, it is important to distinguish between awareness—having the appropriate information—and the impartiality of information, advice and guidance provided through Careers Wales. That is a very important principle. It is not about promoting a specific route or outcome, but about working with an individual to help them understand where they are, and to help them work through their career planning at the stages where they need to take things forward to develop their own career. There is a difference between that advice and guidance, and the active promotion of any specific outcome.

[85] **Joyce Watson:** I accept that, but this is a real and genuine opportunity. You are not saying, ‘We want you to join this person or that person to carry out the work.’ However, this is a genuine opportunity that is coming to Wales first. Therefore, there is a genuine opportunity for a career, which is what you are advising people about. Maybe I did not explain my question well enough. What I am trying to get at is this: how do you see genuine opportunities that are happening here and now and in the near future, and feed those in, through your mechanisms, protocols and perhaps with sector skills councils or through research and development at universities? That is what I really want to know.

[86] **Mr Drakeford:** I think that ‘labour market intelligence’ would be the term that we would use to describe what I think you are referring to. We need to know what the labour market trends are, and what the up and coming business opportunities and employment opportunities might look like. We need to feed that into curriculum planning at schools, and we have a part to play in being the bridge between what is happening, and what is predicted to be happening, in the world of work, and what the curriculum needs to gear up to provide in order to be able to skill people up to take advantage of those opportunities, if they wish to do so. So, yes, we do—

[87] **Nick Ramsay:** Alun Ffred, do you have a supplementary question on this?

[88] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydych yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** You list examples of the rhestru enghreifftiau o weithgareddau yr activities that you have provided. One of ydych wedi’u darparu. Mae un ohonynt yn these reads, under the Young Enterprise dweud, o dan y pennawd *Young Enterprise*: heading:

[89] ‘Funding support, around £100,000 per annum to the Young Enterprise for its company and team enterprise programmes.’

[90] Clywsom y bore yma fod yr arian ar We heard this morning that the funding for gyfer cefnogi *Young Enterprise* wedi supporting Young Enterprise had diflannu. A ydych yn disgwyl i’r bobl hyn i disappeared. Do you expect these people to weithredu’r rhaglen hon heb arian? Neu, a implement this programme without money? yw’r arian hwn ar gael, ond bydd yn rhaid Or, is this funding available, but they will

iddynt ddod o hyd i ragor o arian rhywle have to find more funding somewhere else?  
arall? Neu, a ydwyf wedi camddeall y Or, have I misunderstood this information?  
wybodaeth hon?

[91] **Mr Drakeford:** The line to which you refer, on page 2, describes the arrangements that Careers Wales had with Young Enterprise up until the end of the 2012 business year. So, Careers Wales was, on average, providing a contract to Young Enterprise Wales to the value of £100,000 per annum. That discontinued from the current business year. The discontinuation of that was discussed and agreed amicably with Young Enterprise Wales in the year leading up to it, because we knew that this was going to happen.

[92] **Alun Ffred Jones:** It did not seem so amicable when its representatives spoke to use this morning.

[93] **Mr Drakeford:** It was amicable when I was there. I have no doubt that it is regrettable to them.

[94] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Did you think that the programme was not working?

[95] **Mr Drakeford:** No, or we would not have supported it until 2012.

[96] **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, why did you discontinue it? You must have thought that it was not worth—.

[97] **Mr Drakeford:** No. It is because our remit has changed. We are no longer charged with the delivery—either directly or indirectly through subcontractors—of enterprise programmes in classrooms. Our remit is to engage employers to support voluntarily, through their time, the generating of excitement and so on in respect of enterprise. Our focus has changed, and our budget has changed.

[98] **Nick Ramsay:** We are now overrunning slightly, and so the final question will be asked by Mick Antoniw.

[99] **Mick Antoniw:** I feel that my questions have been answered.

[100] **Nick Ramsay:** Okay, great. I thank our witnesses, Jo Banks and Philip Drakeford, for being with us this afternoon. It has been really helpful, and it will help us in making recommendations in our inquiry. Thanks for your time.

2.05 p.m.

### **Ymchwiliad i Entrepreneuriaeth ymysg Pobl Ifanc—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth Inquiry into Youth Entrepreneurship—Evidence Session**

[101] **Nick Ramsay:** I welcome our two new witnesses—bear with us while we do the changing of the guard, as it were. I cannot think of a better expression. I welcome our two new witnesses, who are the last witnesses in today's meeting. Thank you for providing us with your written papers, and for being with us today. It is very helpful to our considerations. Would you like to give your name and position for the Record of Proceedings, please?

[102] **Ms Poole:** Yes. I am Sue Poole, enterprise education manager at Gower College Swansea, lead in the south-west Wales regional hub.

[103] **Mr Williams:** Emlyn Williams ydw **Mr Williams:** I am Emlyn Williams, i, rheolwr menter Grŵp Llandrillo Menai, ac enterprise manager of Grŵp Llandrillo

arweinydd *hub* y gogledd-orllewin.

Menai, and lead of the north-west Wales regional entrepreneurship hub.

[104] **Nick Ramsay:** Diolch. We have a fair number of questions for you, so I propose that we go straight into them. The first question is from Byron Davies.

[105] **Byron Davies:** Hello. Good afternoon to you. My question really is a very general one. What is the process through which Gower College Swansea and Coleg Menai became the strategic leads for the hubs in south-west Wales and north-west Wales respectively?

[106] **Lord Elis-Thomas:** It is because they are very clever.

[107] **Byron Davies:** Right. [*Laughter.*]

[108] **Ms Poole:** I will take that question first. Gower College Swansea had successfully run a consortium prior to last year with Swansea University and Swansea Metropolitan University, Neath Port Talbot College and Gower College as partners. So, we had some experience of running a collaborative centre. Also, because Gower College is the hub of enterprise activity in south-west Wales, there was a natural feeling among all partners that we would be the natural lead to actually take on this consortium.

[109] **Byron Davies:** That has answered that one quite straightforwardly.

[110] **Mr Williams:** Pan ddaeth y gwahoddiad i sefydlu'r bartneriaeth, mi oedd Grŵp Llandrillo Menai yn golegau ar wahân—roeddwn i'n gweithio yng Ngholeg Menai. Digwydd bod, daeth y cynlluniau at ei gilydd i brifathro Coleg Menai arwain ar fentergarwch yn y grŵp. Felly, enillodd y blaen a gwahodd Prifysgol Bangor i gyfarfod. Mewn sgwrs rhwng y prifathro a swyddogion y brifysgol, daethpwyd i gytundeb y byddai'n addas i Goleg Menai, fel yr oedd ar y pryd, arwain, gan fynd yn rhan o'r grŵp wedyn. I raddau, roeddem yn gorfod arwain o ran tynnu'r grŵp at ei gilydd, beth bynnag, ac roedd yn gwneud synnwyr i ni ddod â Phrifysgol Bangor yn rhan o'r arweiniad hwnnw.

**Mr Williams:** When the invitation came to establish the partnership, Grŵp Llandrillo Menai comprised separate colleges—I was working in Coleg Menai. As it happened, the plans came together for the head of Coleg Menai to lead on entrepreneurship in the group. So, he took the lead and invited Bangor University to a meeting. In a conversation between the principal and university officials, it was agreed that it would be appropriate for Coleg Menai, as it was at that time, to lead, with it then forming part of the group. To a certain extent, we had to lead in bringing the group together in any case, and it then made sense that we should bring Bangor University into that leadership team.

[111] **Byron Davies:** Thank you for that. So, what does the role of strategic lead involve? Could you enlighten me on that, please? Allied to that, how are you avoiding any regional variations in the way that the different hubs operate?

[112] **Mr Williams:** Mae'r rôl yn cychwyn o'r cais ar y strategaeth y daethom i mewn ag ef, a'r peth pwysicaf yr oedd yn rhaid inni ei wneud o'r cychwyn oedd sicrhau bod ein partneriaeth yn dod at ei gilydd mewn ffordd fel bod modd i ni gydweithio. Hefyd, rhaid oedd sicrhau nad oeddem, yn y cynllunio strategaeth a'r bartneriaeth, yn lleihau'r gwasanaeth a oedd yn bodoli yn barod, achos yr oeddem wedi gweithio'n galed i sefydlu

**Mr Williams:** The role emerges from the application of the strategy that we submitted, and one of the most important things that we had to do originally was to ensure that our partnership came together in such a way that we could collaborate. Also, we had to ensure that, in planning the strategy and the partnership, we did not diminish the service already in existence, because we had worked hard to establish an entrepreneurship

gwasanaeth yn hybu entrepreneuriaeth yn y colegau. Felly, mi ddywedwn iddi gymryd y chwe mis cyntaf i sefydlu a chael y strategaeth yn ei lle, ond yn dal i wneud yr hyn yr oeddem yn ei wneud gynt.

promoting service in the colleges. So, I would say that it took us the first six months to establish and get the strategy and in place, while continuing to do what we did previously.

[113] Mae'r ail chwe mis wedi dod i edrych ar beth yr ydym yn ei wneud orau, a phwy sy'n gallu arwain, achos mae rhai a chanddynt flaenoriaeth, wedi cael mwy o lwyddiant nag eraill, ac rydym wedi trial adnabod pwy sy'n arwain ar beth. Wedyn, tua diwedd y flwyddyn, rydym yn edrych ymlaen at gynllunio sut y gallwn ni fanteisio ar y cryfder sydd gennym ni fel grŵp i ddatblygu syniadau newydd wrth symud ymlaen.

The second six month-period has led us to look at what we do best, and who is able to lead, because some will take priority, having had more success than others, and we have tried to identify who leads on what. Then, towards the end of this year, we are looking to plan for how we can benefit from the strengths we have as a group in developing new ideas moving forward.

[114] O ran cydweithio rhwng yr *hubs*, nid ydym wedi cael llawer o gyfleoedd i edrych ar beth mae'r *hubs* eraill yn ei wneud. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth sydd angen ei ddatblygu, achos rwy'n siŵr ein bod wedi bod yn datblygu systemau tebyg, ac efallai y gallef fod wedi manteisio o weld pwy sy'n cael mwy o lwyddiant efo rhai pethau na'i gilydd. Fodd bynnag, dim ond blwyddyn rydym wedi bod wrthi, ac rydym wedi bod yn canolbwyntio eleni ar roi'r bartneriaeth yn ei lle a gwneud yn siŵr bod gwasanaeth yno i'r myfyrwyr.

In terms of joint working between the hubs, we have not had many opportunities to look at what the other hubs are doing. That is something that needs to be developed, because I am sure that we have developed similar systems, and perhaps we could have benefited from seeing who is having more success with some things than others. However, we have only been going a year, and we have focused this year on putting the partnership in place, to ensure that there is a service in place for the students.

[115] **Ms Poole:** I totally agree with what Emlyn said. We were really lucky in south-west Wales, because we have worked collaboratively for some time. As well as working with the universities within Swansea, we have also worked with Coleg Sir Gâr and Pembroke College. So, we were in a really lucky situation in that it was a natural progression for us to work more collaboratively.

[116] I agree with Emlyn that it was a huge learning curve for us over the first six to nine months. However, we are learning as we are going along from some of the successes that we have had. We are making sure that partners share best practice and we are supporting each other. That is what we have done particularly well—supporting by doing collaborative events, and also supporting those who perhaps have been struggling with difficulties within the FE and HE institutions that they work in.

[117] I see that our role as a hub is to provide leadership, leading by example, helping with resources, helping with collaborative activities and training. A lot of the centres may not have worked collaboratively previously, so we have been quite heavily involved in a lot of training, and going out to the different FE and HE institutions as part of that hub to support them. The paperwork is onerous, and it is quite difficult to get our head around it. It has changed a number of times during the period, but we are trying to get all partners to be in a position where that would be a small part of the work that we do. It is about helping young people and making them much more entrepreneurial. That is our main focus.

[118] **Keith Davies:** Byddaf yn gofyn yn **Keith Davies:** I will ask in Welsh.



Gymraeg.

[119] Roeddwn yn mynd i ofyn am natur y gweithgareddau sydd gennych. Rydych wedi sôn am addysg uwch ac addysg bellach. Beth am yr ysgolion? Rydym yn sôn am y bobl ifanc hyn. Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud gyda nhw? Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud gydag ysgolion uwchradd, er enghraifft?

I was going to ask about the nature of the activities that you have. You mentioned higher education and further education. What about the schools? We are talking about these young people. What are you doing with them? What are you doing with secondary schools, for example?

[120] **Mr Williams:** Rwyf yn reit lwcus. Yng Ngwynedd a Môn, mae cynllun o'r enw 'Llwyddo'n Lleol', sy'n golygu cydweithio efo'r ysgolion a'r colegau i roi help a chyfleoedd mentergarwch i fyfyrwyr. Roedd y cynllun hwnnw yn cael ei redeg fel tindr gan y cyngor sir, ac fel coleg gwnaethom dendro i weithio gydag ef i redeg y gweithgaredd mewn ysgolion. Felly, mae gennym ddarlithwyr sy'n mynd allan i ysgolion uwchradd i redeg cyrsiau mentergarwch. Mae gennym hefyd berthynas efo Menter a Busnes, sy'n bartner i ni yn y tindr hwnnw. Mae Menter a Busnes hefyd wedi tendro i wneud gwaith cefnogaeth fusnes. Felly, rydym yn ffodus ein bod wedi dewis partner iawn, ac wedi cael y cyfle i dendro ac ennill y tindr. Mae wedi rhoi cyfle inni fynd i mewn i ysgolion. Y gwendid hyd yma—ac rydym yn edrych arno ar hyn o bryd—yw sicrhau cysondeb mewn ysgolion o ran cefnogaeth i'r myfyrwyr sydd yn disgleirio, neu sy'n dangos bod ganddynt rhyw fentergarwch arbennig ynddynt, fel ein bod yn gwneud siŵr pan maent yn dod i'r coleg ein bod yn rhoi gwerth ar ben yr hyn maent wedi ei gael yn barod. Rwyf wedi sylweddoli nad ydym o anghenraid wedi bod yn gwneud hynny. Mae angen inni edrych ar ddatblygu yn ifanc iawn y rhai â chanddynt y sbarc—nid wyf yn gwybod beth rydych chi'n ei alw—o fentergarwch, ac sy'n awyddus. Os gallwn gychwyn yn eu blwyddyn gyntaf yn y coleg drwy roi gymaint o help ag y gallwn iddynt, a hwythau wedi ei gael yn yr ysgol, byddwn yn eu symud yn eu blaen.

**Mr Williams:** I am quite lucky. In Gwynedd and Anglesey, there is a scheme called 'Llwyddo'n Lleol', which means working collaboratively with the schools and colleges to provide entrepreneurial support and opportunities to students. That scheme was run as a tender by the county council, and as a college we tendered to work with it to undertake that activity in schools. So, we have lecturers who go out to secondary schools to run entrepreneurship courses. We also have a partnership with Menter a Busnes, which is our partner in that tender. Menter a Busnes has also tendered to undertake business support work. So, we are fortunate that we have chosen the correct partner, and have had the opportunity to bid for and win the tender. It has given us an opportunity to go into schools. The weakness thus far—and we are looking at it at the moment—is in ensuring consistency in schools in terms of support for students who show promise, or show that they are particularly entrepreneurial, so that we ensure that, when they come to the college, we add value over and above what they already have. I have realised that we have not necessarily been doing that. We have to look at developing from an early age those who have that entrepreneurial spark—I am not sure what you would call it—and are eager. If we can begin when they are in their first year of college by giving them as much assistance as possible, when they have already had a grounding in school, we will progress them.

[121] **Keith Davies:** Beth os ydynt yn mynd i'r chweched dosbarth?

**Keith Davies:** What if they go to sixth form?

2.15 p.m.

[122] **Mr Williams:** Nid wyf yn meddwl fod ots. Byddant yn mynd i brifysgol, ond gobeithio y byddant wedi cael y sbarc. Mae'n

**Mr Williams:** I do not think that it matters. They might go to university, but hopefully, they will have had that spark. It depends on

dibynnu lle y byddant yn mynd. Efallai y byddant yn mynd i Loegr. Os ydynt yn mynd i brifysgol yng Nghymru, bydd ganddynt well gobaith o gael cefnogaeth. O ran eich gwariant chi, o fewn prifysgolion, rydym yn gwario arian ar bobl sy'n dod i Gymru i gael eu haddysg, ac mae rhywun yn pryderu am fyfyrwyr Cymreig sy'n gadael Cymru nad ydynt, efallai, yn cael yr un peth. Ond, ni wn sut y byddech yn—

[123] **Keith Davies:** Clywsom yn gynharach—nid wyf yn cofio'n union pryd, gan ein bod wedi clywed cymaint heddiw—y bydd bagloriaeth Cymru i bawb o 2014, ac na fydd dewis gan bobl; bydd yn rhaid iddynt ei dilyn. Os ydych chi yn y chweched dosbarth, bydd yn rhaid i chi edrych ar fenter ac ati. Felly, pwy, yn eich ardal chi fydd yn cefnogi plant sydd yn y chweched dosbarth?

[124] **Mr Williams:** Heblaw am y gwaith drwy Llwyddo'n Lleol, nid oes gennym elfen o'r strategaeth sy'n ymwneud â gweithio gydag ysgolion. Gallem ddatblygu cynllun i gynnig rhywbeth i ysgolion, ond, o fewn yr hyn sydd gennym i weithio gydag ef, os wyf yn defnyddio arian o fy mhhecyn ariannol i gynnig gwasanaeth i ysgolion, mae hwnnw'n arian na fyddai ar gael ar gyfer y myfyrwyr sydd gennym yn ein colegau, ac mae miloedd garw o'r rheini. Mae'n anodd iawn.

[125] **Keith Davies:** Onid oes pwyllgor gennych sy'n edrych ar addysg 14-19? A yw'r coleg yn rhan o hwnnw?

[126] **Mr Williams:** Oes. Mae'r wybodaeth ynglŷn â'r hyn rydym yn ei wneud yn cael ei throsglwyddo i'r pwyllgor, iddo fod yn ymwybodol ohonno, ond nid yw'r cysylltiad mor agos â hynny. Efallai fod gan Sue mwy o gysylltiad—

[127] **Keith Davies:** Rydych wedi rhoi cynnig yn eich papur ynglŷn ag ysgolion yn Abertawe, a'r ffaith nad ydynt yn rhan o'r rhwydwaith *hub*. Felly, beth yw'r sefyllfa yn eich ardal chi?

[128] **Ms Poole:** I really appreciate that question. It is a passion of mine that we start at a very young age. About five years ago, when I started delivering entrepreneurship and managing the area, it was something that I was very keen to progress. We started working with three local primary schools in Swansea. We would take a group of our Welsh baccalaureate students out to primary schools to deliver a 10-week enterprise course to

where they go. They might go to England. If they go to a Welsh university, they will have a better chance of getting support. In terms of your expenditure, in universities, we are spending money on people who come to Wales for their education, and one is concerned about Welsh students who leave Wales who do not, perhaps, get the same support. However, I am not sure how you would—

**Keith Davies:** We heard earlier—I am not sure exactly when, as we have heard so much today—that, from 2014, the Welsh baccalaureate will be for everyone and there will not be a choice; they will have to take it. If you are in the sixth form, you will have to look at entrepreneurship and so forth. So, who, in your area will support those children in the sixth form?

**Mr Williams:** Apart from the work through Llwyddo'n Lleol, we do not have an element of the strategy that involves working with schools. We could develop a scheme to offer something to schools, but, in terms of what we have to work with, if I use money out of my financial package to provide a service to schools, it is money that I would not then have available for our students in colleges, and there are many thousands of them. It is very difficult.

**Keith Davies:** Do you not have a committee looking at 14-19 education? Is the college a part of that?

**Mr Williams:** Yes. Information about what we do is transferred to the committee, to make it aware of that, but the links are not that close. Sue may have more contact—

**Keith Davies:** You included a proposal in your paper on schools in Swansea and the fact that they are not part of the hub network. So, what is the situation in your area?

primary school children. That helped to embed entrepreneurial skills in our students, while working with young people. It was extremely successful and grew, with a large number of primary schools asking us to work with them. I believe that you need to instil entrepreneurial skills in very young children. I think that we need to start with primary schools and even registration ages.

[129] The project grew to nine local primary schools and, over the last few years, we have developed a mini dragons competition in Swansea, where primary school children have a small pot of money, which I will talk about in a second, and they have to pitch for the money. They come up with a project, product or service, then take the money and purchase the products that they have to merchandise and sell. That has been a really successful project that we first started in Swansea. I am really pleased to say that this year, the Minister, Mrs Hart, has launched a new primary school national competition to develop entrepreneurial skills in the very young.

[130] **Nick Ramsay:** We took some evidence in our last meeting that suggested that 11 or 12 was a good age to start, but you are saying that actually, we should be teaching—

[131] **Ms Poole:** Younger. Absolutely, Chair. They are so open; they are like sponges and they are enthusiastic and motivated and do not see anything as a problem. So, we should get that spark and fire in their bellies and continue to develop that right through primary and secondary schools. When they come to me, in 10 or 15 years—although I probably will not be there then—they will have started to develop those very important entrepreneurial employability skills.

[132] I will move on to secondary schools. This year, we launched the young business dragons, which is a step up. I have obtained funding from employers across Wales—companies like Wales & West Utilities, Carillion, Tata Steel and Derwen Construction. We have raised £20,000 in the last three weeks to be able to launch a competition. All schools in Pembrokeshire, Carmarthenshire, Neath Port Talbot and Swansea, and all secondary schools' year 9s, take part in the competition. It is a six-month competition in which they have to come up with a product or a service that is related to a theme. This year, the theme is rather a nautical one, related to tourism in the four beautiful counties that we have. They then have to work over the next six months on coming up with a business idea. They then have to go to a semi-final, and we have a major final in November, during enterprise week, where we have two winners from each county, to crown the winner of the dragons for the whole of south-west Wales. All of this, and the primary school work, has been obtained and run via funding from outside the Welsh Government money. As Emlyn said, our budgets are focused on FE and HE, but because my colleagues and I feel that it is really important that young people—at a much younger age—are engaged in entrepreneurial activities, we have had to think outside the box and look at how we are going to get the funds to support this.

[133] There is another element that we run. We have mentioned the 14-19. We run enterprise boot camps. I have obtained funding from the 14-19 money, and other areas, in small pots of money—I am talking about sums of between £3,000 and £5,000—and we run enterprise boot camps throughout the summer, in which we bring secondary school students in and give them a taste of enterprise over a full, intense week. By the time they come to college, in a year or so, they have started to build those entrepreneurial skills.

[134] So, it is about looking at other income streams and other ways in which we can develop the skills, and I am really passionate about needing to start at a much younger age. I am really pleased that you brought that question up. Thank you.

[135] **Keith Davies:** I orffen ar hynny, beth **Keith Davies:** Just to finish on that, what yw'r targedau sydd gennych chi? A yw'r targets do you have? Will those targets

targedau hynny'n mynd i ymateb i'r targedau gan y Llywodraeth? respond to the Government's targets?

[136] **Ms Poole:** Obviously, as part of our bid as the south-west Wales region, we had to put in initial targets. They were based on FE and HE, and also on community and those not working—that is, the NEET targets. We work with community and with the YMCA—we work with a number of different areas to develop skills, not just within education.

[137] Within primary and secondary education, we have no targets. However, I believe that every single student should have at least one opportunity to engage with entrepreneurship, and to try to continue that. We are, and will be, working with the national continuing professional development hub to develop staff right across Wales in secondary schools and in FE and HE, to develop the teaching skills to enable the Welsh baccalaureate to be delivered in the most effective way.

[138] **Nick Ramsay:** Alun Ffred Jones has the next question.

[139] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Byddaf yn gofyn yn Gymraeg.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I will ask my question in Welsh.

[140] Mae'r cwestiwn sydd gennyf yn un nad wyf yn ei ddeall, ond fe'i gofynnaf yr un fath. Sut y mae'r canolfannau rhanbarthol yn gweithio gyda chanolfan datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus Cymru gyfan, sydd wedi'i lleoli, mae'n debyg, ym Mhrifysgol De Cymru?

The question that I have is not one that I understand, but I will ask it just the same. How do the regional hubs work with the all-Wales continuing professional development hub, based, apparently, at the University of South Wales?

[141] **Mr Williams:** Rwy'n meddwl mai'r ateb i hynny yw ei bod yn ddyddiau cynnar. Rhoesom geisiadau ar wahân i mewn ar gychwyn fis Medi diwethaf—roedd ein trwynau i lawr i afael ynddi mor sydyn. Roedd yr *hub CPD*, fel mae'n cael ei alw yn gyffredin, yn hwyrach yn rhoi ei gais i mewn, achos nad oedd modd delio â'r broses i gyd gyda'i gilydd. Roedd hi tua'r Nadolig ar bobl yn cael gwybod a oeddent wedi cael yr arian ac ati. Mae un gynhadledd wedi'i chynnal i ddod â ni ynghyd i wneud rhyw fath o arolwg o anghenion darlithwyr a staff y colegau, o ran hyfforddiant a phethau felly, ac mae gweithredu wedi bod ar un yn arbennig—nid wyf yn siŵr iawn o'r cyfieithiad—sef yr *international entrepreneurship educators' programme*. Rhywbeth Prydeinig yw hwnnw, ar lefel ôl-radd. Wedyn, gwnaethom geisiadau i gael staff a oedd yn arbenigo i gael datblygiad drwy wneud y cwrs hwnnw. Felly, rydym yn arwain ar hynny i ddechrau, ond mae lot mwy o waith i'w wneud. Hyd yma, cyn belled ag yr wyf i yn y cwestiwn, dyna fel y bu'r berthynas.

**Mr Williams:** I think that the response to that is that it is early days. We put separate bids in at the start of September—we had our shoulder to the wheel to get things going that quickly. The CPD hub, as it is generally called, put its application in later, because the whole process could not be dealt with simultaneously. It was around Christmas before people heard whether they had got the funding and so on. One conference has been held to bring everyone together to carry out some sort of survey of the needs of lecturers and staff at the colleges, in terms of training and so on, and action has been taken on one in particular, namely the international entrepreneurship educators' programme. This is a UK-wide programme at postgraduate level. Then, we put in bids for staff who could specialise in this area to be developed through that course. So, we are leading on that to start with, but there is a lot more work to be done. So far, as far as I am concerned, that is what the relationship has consisted of.

[142] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, beth yn

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Therefore, what exactly

union yw pwrpas y ganolfan?

is the purpose of the hub?

[143] **Ms Poole:** I can answer that question. I was very pleased to be asked to work with the CPD hub to develop the training material for staff. I am working really closely with Dinah Griffiths, who is leading the CPD hub. At the moment, we are in the process of looking at putting some training packages together for all levels within education. So, they are not just for teaching staff, but for middle managers, senior managers and governors in the institutions. We feel that it is important that all levels understand the importance of the entrepreneurial skills, not just the teaching staff; it has to come from the top.

[144] At the moment, we are developing the material. As Emlyn said, they had their bid a little later than ours, so they are a couple of months behind us. However, the main task would be to look at putting packages together that could be delivered. My colleagues and I will be part of the delivery team going around Wales to support institutions to embed entrepreneurialism, not just for the teaching staff, but right through all levels within each institution.

[145] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Hoffwn ofyn un cwestiwn arall. Yn eich tystiolaeth chi o Goleg Menai, rydych yn cyfeirio at ddigwyddiad y llynedd pan fu i'ch myfyrwyr gystadlu mewn cystadleuaeth ryngwladol yn Siapan. Daethant yn drydydd ac enillon nhw glod mawr. Y sylw yr ydych yn ei wneud yw ei bod yn amhosibl cael sylw i hynny yn y cyfryngau yng Nghymru—oherwydd bod cymaint o newyddion diddorol ar y rhaglenni hynny. A yw hynny'n brofiad cyffredin neu gyson? Efallai y gallech chi hefyd sôn am eich profiad chi yn y de-orllewin.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I would like to ask one more question. In your evidence from Coleg Menai, you refer to an incident last year when your students competed in an international competition in Japan. They came third and gained a lot of praise. The comment that you make is that it is impossible to get any coverage for that in the media in Wales—because there is so much interesting news on those programmes. Is that a common or frequent experience? Perhaps you could also talk about your experience in the south-west.

[146] **Ms Poole:** Shall I answer it from my point of view first? We are extremely lucky and we have had the opposite experience in Swansea. We had ITV Wales down in October when we launched the Entrepreneurship Academy Wales, which is Wales's first course aimed directly at young entrepreneurs aged 16 to 19. We have had continued press in the paper. We have the graduation next week, and ITV and BBC news have shown interest in coming to speak to the students. It is a huge success story. However, it is about making sure that you put the news out continuously and that you have the right contacts. In Swansea, we are extremely lucky to have those. So, I have had the opposite experience to Emlyn's.

[147] **Mr Williams:** Roedd hynny'n rhwystredigaeth fawr i mi ac rwy'n ffeindio mai dyna yw'r achos yn aml. Y *Daily Post* yw ein papur ni yng ngogledd Cymru, ond mae ei ymateb wedi bod yn wan iawn. Nid oes ganddo fawr o ddiddordeb. Roedd y gystadleuaeth honno yn bwysig iawn. Bu inni roi gwybodaeth i'r cyfryngau yn bell cyn mynd, bu i ni atgyfnerthu hynny ac roeddem yn trydar yn barhaol er mwyn i'r wybodaeth am yr hyn oedd yn digwydd fod ar gael drwy Twitter, gan feddwl y byddai rhywun yn pigo hynny i fyny. Radio Cymru oedd yr unig un a gymerodd sylw cenedlaethol. Cynhaliwyd cyfweiliadau gyda'r myfyrwyr dros y ffôn o

**Mr Williams:** That was a major frustration for me and I find that it is often the case. The *Daily Post* is our paper in north Wales, and its response has been very weak. It has no interest. That competition was very important. We provided information to the media long before we went, we supported that and we tweeted frequently in order for information about what was happening to be available through Twitter, thinking that someone would pick up on that. Radio Cymru was the only one to take any notice on a national level. Interviews were conducted with the students over the phone from Japan and those interviews were broadcast on their

Siapan a darlledwyd y cyfweiliadau hynny ar ei rhaglenni. Fodd bynnag, o ran y papurau newydd— programmes. However, with regard to newspapers—

[148] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, y wers yw eich bod yn y rhan anghywir o Gymru o safbwynt teledu a'i bod yn haws cael sylw os ydych yn agosach at Gaerdydd. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Therefore, the lesson is that you are in the wrong part of Wales with regard to television and that it is easier to get coverage if you are closer to Cardiff.

[149] **Nick Ramsay:** Dafydd Elis-Thomas has a supplementary question.

[150] **Lord Elis-Thomas:** With regard to the academy, am I right in thinking that you have 10 students on the programme?

[151] **Ms Poole:** Yes, we have 10.

[152] **Lord Elis-Thomas:** Will that continue?

[153] **Ms Poole:** Yes, we are in the process of recruiting next year's cohort. We did a small pilot scheme this year. It is based in the Dylan Thomas Centre in Swansea. We wanted to have it in a very busy environment, rather than in a college. We had 10 students, who will graduate next week. Of the 10, seven are setting up in business—four are already trading and the other three will be ready to launch the week after they finish. So, with a 70% success rate, we are absolutely delighted. However, the crucial part of that has been the mentoring and the sponsorship that we have had from industry. It is crucially important for us that we have the industry links and that we have business engaged with us. To run the course without that support would be very difficult.

2.30 p.m.

[154] The first task last year was for me to find 10 financial sponsors. Each student is given £1,000 by their sponsor, who mentors them throughout the year and works with them throughout the year to give as much or as little advice and guidance as that student needs. The student works with the sponsor as an intern over a period of months in order to see how the business is run. That business engagement is crucially important at any stage, and it is one with which we really have been extremely lucky, as I mentioned in terms of the business dragons. If you ask business, they want to help; they want to get engaged. All you have to do is ask. That is crucially important.

[155] **Lord Elis-Thomas:** You will know that we will produce a report of this particular inquiry. If we were to highlight this as best practice, do you think that it is a model that is transferable elsewhere—the notion of the academy?

[156] **Ms Poole:** There is absolutely no doubt about that. We were lucky that we had a candidate who travelled all the way from north Wales to apply to the academy. He was from Pwllheli; a young Welsh-speaking farmer who came down with his dad. I interviewed them, and he moved down here for the year. He will graduate next week. He has his business up and running, and he is going back to Pwllheli. He never thought that he would as he could not wait to get away, but he now realises how important home is, and he really appreciates it. His mum and dad are farmers, but they are business people and he cannot wait to go back there and make a difference in his local area.

[157] **Lord Elis-Thomas:** You must give me his name and address. [*Laughter.*]

[158] **Ms Poole:** I will do.

[159] **Mick Antoniw:** How closely do you work with Careers Wales? How close is the collaboration?

[160] **Ms Poole:** It used to be much closer. It used to be a wonderful support service for further education and schools. It used to come in to deliver a number of different enterprise activities. I was listening to Philip's comments earlier; I was here some 45 minutes ago listening to them. It was a fantastic support. At the minute, it has moved away to the brokerage; so, it is brokering local employers to come to work within the schools. So, it has changed. I would not say that it is for the better, but we are really lucky—and I will say it as it is, but that is the truth—that we have a couple of people working for Careers Wales who are very supportive. With the young business dragons, they are working on bringing in mentors. We have 40 secondary schools and each school has a business mentor. That is brokered through Careers Wales. So, it has been supportive there.

[161] **Mick Antoniw:** How have you managed to develop so well the relationship with local businesses? What has inspired business, or whatever, to engage? Quite often, it is a difficult area.

[162] **Ms Poole:** It can be seen as a difficult area, but we just have not had that problem. If you go along and you talk about your vision and what you want for Wales, Swansea or the area, you find that businesses are more than happy to put in not just their money in, but their time, to develop young people. It is what they did not have at school, so they can see the benefits of them coming in. So, we have not had a problem. I will not say that that is the same across Wales, but I do not think that they are any different in Swansea. I was talking to Simon Gibson from Alacrity last week. He mentioned that he went to see 51 businesses and asked them to give up a day, and 50 businesses said 'yes'. So, it is not just an anomaly to Swansea. I think that you just have to ask the question, really. You have to go out and ask. Knock on those doors, go in and ask the question.

[163] **Nick Ramsay:** Ask the question. Talking of asking questions, the next one is from David Rees.

[164] **David Rees:** I think that you have already answered some of the points, but this is on the funding aspects. Clearly, you have both expressed views that the funding that you have received for the basic core work is minimal, shall we say, and just about manages, but your experience is that you have gone out and got funding. Is that common across the rest of the hubs?

[165] **Ms Poole:** Within south-west Wales, I encourage partners to do exactly the same. For example, with the 14-19 agenda and with the sponsorship from industry, it is not something that we keep to ourselves in Swansea. We encourage other partners to do that and, indeed, they have, because we have Carmarthenshire, Pembrokeshire and Neath and Port Talbot as part of this competition. They have had to go out to look for funding. So, yes, we will share it. I do not think that we are any different in south Wales, as Emlyn will find in north Wales. You just have to look elsewhere. You cannot rely on the Government for all of the money coming in. You have to look outside and look for other income streams.

[166] **Mr Williams:** We have looked for other funding, as has Sue. Given that we have not worked together as a combination of hubs we are not really aware, and you must be. If you just keep within the funding that you have, the service that you are able to provide is minimal. As I say, we put in a tender for the Llwyddo'n Lleol work. I know that Bangor University has a partnership with Santander, which brings in other funding for entrepreneurial work. We also work with Bangor University on a European project called Access to Masters, which enables us to have Master's students doing some analysis looking at social enterprise and working

with young entrepreneurs, but that is European funded. It enables us to have more people doing different things, but you have to be creative in finding that funding.

[167] **David Rees:** As I understand it, it is three-year funding, which, in one sense, is good, because it allows you some sort of indication of how to operate for the next three years, but what is the position after the three years? Do you know where you stand? Are you supposed to be self-sustainable within three years?

[168] **Mr Williams:** I cannot see how we could be self-sustainable, to be truthful, because the funding that comes in is for the education that we deliver, and the teaching faculties need all that funding to deliver the education. This is adding extra value. If the funding is not there to add that extra value, I cannot see where it could come from, apart from what is embedded. We are trying as much as we can to embed it and support enterprise activity within the curriculum, to enable that to be more creative and interesting, if you like. That will be maintained, and once the lecturers have found good ways of addressing enterprise within the course, they will keep doing that, but it is the added step of having events where you can identify who has that little bit of spark, and providing the extra support get them to a position where they can decide whether it is a clear option for them and whether they want to have a clear go at it, is the sort of thing that would disappear. At the moment, we are unaware of what will happen after the three years. It has been a godsend to have the three years. We have never had it before and, as I said, we have a process that we are going through now to develop our strategy and work on the strategy, so I do not want to put it down. The fact that we have three years is a real bonus from our point of view.

[169] **Joyce Watson:** Good afternoon. I want to explore young people's attitudes towards being an entrepreneur and their experiences. Do you believe that there is sufficient coherence and clarity on the options and routes available to them? We have not heard that in this evidence so far this morning.

[170] **Ms Poole:** I can answer that quickly: it is a minefield out there. Where do they go? Who do they turn to? Where do they go first? Some of the time we do not know, and we are on the ground, so it is an absolute maze. There are so many providers and so many places that they could go to. I am really keen—and this summer we are looking to work on this in south-west Wales—for students to have a road map; a guide to exactly where to go if they have an idea and are looking for support and finance. It is particularly pertinent with my 10 in the academy. I am going to say it: I sent them to the support agencies for advice and guidance on funding, and they came back to say that there was no funding available. Of course, we have the young person's bursary of £6,000, so if the providers do not know what is available, that is a bit worrying. At the minute it is a bit of a mess, and it does need clarity.

[171] **Joyce Watson:** So how are we going to sort it out?

[172] **Ms Poole:** In south-west Wales, we are going to do it ourselves. So, at least our students will be okay, but it is something that the Government needs to look at—having some kind of one-stop shop. I was reading the paper from the Chamber of Commerce in readiness for today, and it has come up with a centre of excellence for entrepreneurship; that is a fantastic first idea. We have been looking to do it in Swansea—to have a point of contact, a one-stop shop, where students of any age can turn to, whether they are from primary or whatever, or any person looking to set up a business, or with an enterprising idea. They need somewhere, some person or location that they can go to.

[173] **Mr Williams:** There is a telephone number and website to refer students on to, but the worry that we have constantly with that is that we will lose track of them. If you tell a student, 'Ring this number and you will be directed to the right avenue for support', you need to get hold of that student again in order to find out whether they got what they needed, and



whether they had the right relationship with the guidance counsellor, and whether it worked. We need to have that feedback, and that has been difficult to maintain.

[174] **Joyce Watson:** I have two questions that I will roll into one. Do you think that young people are more interested in becoming entrepreneurs than they were before now—which would have been yesterday? Do you also think that their background, family influences, or any other influences for that matter, make a difference to a young person's attitude towards being a young entrepreneur?

[175] **Mr Williams:** I have been involved with entrepreneurship in an FE context for the last 10 years. When I first started, the majority of students who showed an inclination came from families who were already in business. It was a worry at the time, because I was thinking 'Where are the rest of them?' That has changed. We now get a lot of students who do not have a business background at all, and they are far more open to think of entrepreneurship as being an option for them. I am confident about that. The number of Welsh speakers who come through who want help or show themselves as being enterprising still worries me. Llwyddo'n Lleol is working hard in Gwynedd to address that. It is a difficult one for us as an FE college, because none of our classes are specifically Welsh-only classes. So, to target something for Welsh speakers is difficult, even if you do it outside the class. We find that FE students are different to HE students—they do not hang about the college. They come for classes and they are out. You have to run something really interesting to hold on to them outside the class environment. It is far easier to get the lecturer to say, 'You're going to that' and then they will come. If you can hold on to them once they have been told to come, you have an opportunity.

[176] **Ms Poole:** My feedback would be, 'Yes, they are much more entrepreneurial now'. There are television programmes—I am not saying that they are good—such as *The Apprentice* and *Dragons' Den*, where you can see the faces of entrepreneurs, whereas years ago we did not know what an entrepreneur was.

[177] As regards families, a lot of our students are from deprived areas with second and third generation unemployed families, and in the east side of Swansea, we have some fantastically innovative heads, especially in primary schools. We find that the most entrepreneurial are those who do things that are not particularly within boundaries. However, all you have to do is to change that enthusiasm. For example, in Craig y Felin, one of our primary schools, they had a young student who used to come in to sell eggs every week. They found that he was stealing the eggs, but he actually made a tidy little profit every week. So, the teacher made him the chief banker at the school, and he would collect all the money from the students who were saving. He now trains the other bankers. So, that shows his enthusiasm and drive and that he is being shown the right direction. It is about showing them the right road, but still encouraging that entrepreneurial spirit.

[178] **Joyce Watson:** He is not getting his eggs for free any more.

[179] **Mick Antoniw:** An appropriate analogy would be—[*Inaudible.*]

[180] **Nick Ramsay:** Dave is next—on eggs or any other subject. [*Laughter.*]

[181] **David Rees:** It is not on eggs, although some of the procedures would be very interesting. Emlyn, you pointed out the issue of students coming in and wanting to go back out—I understand that—but if they are entrepreneurs, we want to nurture their enthusiasm. Is it a case of a lack of enthusiasm at the start, but, as they go through the process, they develop that and therefore want to say a bit more? Or is it simply that, for some of them, it is still a college course and not necessarily something that they feel is the right thing for them?

[182] **Mr Williams:** That is what we try to do and we have two levels. One is the general ‘try to hit as many students as you can with some sort of activity’, and the main purpose of that is to see who pops up above the crowd. The important thing is to identify those students and enthuse them enough to undertake some sort of activity, and to enter competitions; I mentioned in my evidence the Global Enterprise Challenge. I think that competitions for students are superb, because they enjoy the competition, and we can get that working inside the college as well. Lecturers also enjoy it. They hate other departments being successful and having a bit of kudos out of that. So, the next year, they will try to get their students involved. To be truthful, from our point of view, we are not the people who are with the students most of the time; the lecturers are. This comes back to the CPD hub and all the training, as Sue said. We need to get the lecturers enthused and they will then help get their students enthused.

2.45 p.m.

[183] **Nick Ramsay:** Okay, we have got the message for enthusiasm, but I am hurrying things on because we are into the last couple of minutes now. Mick Antoniw, would you like to ask your question now?

[184] **Mick Antoniw:** My question is about the understanding of entrepreneurship. For students aged nine, 10 or 11, I presume that you do not use that sort of terminology, so how do you present to them what you are doing? What is it that you say to inspire them to get an interest in it? Following on from that, do we make enough use of people who have been involved in enterprise, such as those who may be retired, but are keen to utilise their experience? Could we be doing more in that area?

[185] **Mr Williams:** You mentioned students aged nine, 10 and 11; do you mean primary school children?

[186] **Mick Antoniw:** From primary school upwards—from the spark of the idea to the practical implementation.

[187] **Mr Williams:** Like a lot of things with young people, in order to engage them, you cannot necessarily put labels on things. It is more about the activity—finding an activity that they want to engage in. That activity leads you to being able to identify who has an interest and who has a little bit of talent and you can then take that forward and start labelling it as entrepreneurship, if you like. They see things like *Dragons’ Den* on television and you can get them enthused through things like that. However, initially, it is about the activity and team work—identifying who is good at leading teams, because, sometimes, natural team leaders will be enterprising in their attitude. So, those are the sorts of things that we try to do just to get an idea. It is not a science; it is certainly pot luck quite often.

[188] **Ms Poole:** Certainly with the schools that we work with, we do not go in with the term ‘entrepreneurs’. We engage with them with fun, exciting activities and get the students to feed back to us what they think they have gained from the activities and what sort of skills they have developed. We then start talking about what type of things they could use these skills for. It is not just about business start-up; I would like to clear that up. It is not just about starting a business; it is about making young people more entrepreneurial, to become entrepreneurs within a business, for example, in the same way that I think I am within a college; I am an entrepreneur within an institution. So, it is about making them more rounded individuals, so that they can bring something back to the Welsh economy, whether that is through a business start-up, which would be fantastic, or just through being enterprising within an industry.

[189] To answer your question, yes, we do need to engage with those highly experienced, very talented people who are retired and who want to give something back. A lot of our

mentors come from that area.

[190] **Mr Williams:** The Dynamo role mode programme is very valuable to us because we get local entrepreneurs. They are not from somewhere else; they are people who live in our communities and can be recognised as being entrepreneurs.

[191] **Nick Ramsay:** Emlyn, you have mentioned the importance of outcomes, and measuring those under the youth entrepreneurship strategy action plan. Do you think a longer-term analysis of young people's outcomes following enterprise education would be helpful?

[192] **Mr Williams:** It is something that we have talked about in our steering group. The businesspeople on the steering group are not concerned with us showing them whether we are hitting our targets; the numbers, if you like. The first thing I learnt in the first couple of meetings is that they do not really want to know.

[193] **Nick Ramsay:** Certainly by knowing where those young people have gone and what they are doing, you can see whether they have been successful or not.

[194] **Mr Williams:** Exactly. That is what they are asking us, namely how do we measure real outcomes. It is a hard question because we normally do not track them after they leave, and it is going to take five, six or 10 years for a student to have an opportunity. Given what they have done in college, they can measure how valuable that opportunity is to them and consider it, whereas they would have dismissed it otherwise. I do not know how we can track that.

[195] **Nick Ramsay:** That is the trick then; knowing how to do it.

[196] **Ms Poole:** It is. In reading some papers in readiness for today, I saw that Young Enterprise Wales follows a number of its alumni. It quoted some figures and explained that the majority of people who have started up a business and have had a young enterprise experience in school felt that that had led them on the path to think that they could start their own business. So, we are playing a really long game here. However, it is absolutely worth it and crucial.

[197] **Nick Ramsay:** That is a very fitting point on which to finish. I thank our witnesses, Sue Poole and Emlyn Williams for being with us today. It has been really helpful. We will take into account what you have had to say as we form our recommendations in our inquiry. Thank you.

[198] **Ms Poole:** Thank you for the opportunity.

[199] **Mr Williams:** Diolch.

[200] **Nick Ramsay:** That is the end of the public session of this afternoon's meeting of the Enterprise and Business Committee.

2.50 p.m.

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r  
Cyfarfod  
Motion under Standing Order No. 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from  
the Meeting**

[201] **Nick Ramsay:** So that we can now move into private session for our de-brief, I move

that

*the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting in accordance with Standing Order No. 17.42(vi).*

[202] I see that the committee is in agreement.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 2.50 p.m.*

*The public part of the meeting ended at 2.50 p.m.*